

بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ

## Are the Prophets (عليه السلام) alive in their graves

إِنَّ مُحَمَّدًا لِلَّهِ مُحَمَّدٌ وَنَسْتَعِينُهُ، مَنْ يَهْدِهِ اللَّهُ فَلَا مُضِلَّ لَهُ، وَمَنْ يَضِلَّ فَلَا هَادِيَ لَهُ، وَأَشْهَدُ أَنْ لَا إِلَهَ إِلَّا اللَّهُ وَحْدَهُ لَا شَرِيكَ لَهُ، وَأَنَّ مُحَمَّدًا عَبْدُهُ  
وَرَسُولُهُ، أَمَّا بَعْدُ

Today people of this nation (Muslim ummah), gather en-masse over the tombs of dead saints about whom Allah's Book declares that they are dead without an iota of life in them. But the sectarian ulema have propagated that they are alive. (Iss baat ka sabot kiya hy wo quote Karen ye batain kis ne aur kahan likhin hn kiunkay ye baat aam admi ko nahi pata ya na suni ho) This is not today's issue but long before the prophet hood of our Prophet (عليه السلام), the Jews and Christians used to make the tombs of their prophets and pious people, the places of worship. On this, the Prophet (عليه السلام) mentioned in the last days of his life about the curse of Allah Ta'ala on such people and forbade the Muslims from doing it.

But when the *ummah* suffered distortions and the belief about the return of the spirit to the grave was invented then every possible effort was made to prove that the dead is not really dead but he is alive in his grave. In this effort, *ahadith* (prophetic narrations) were invented to prove that our Prophet (ﷺ) and other prophets (عليهم السلام) are alive in their graves. Whereas the principle of two lives and two deaths for human beings declared by Allah Ta'ala is fully implementable even for the prophets. When the deaths of the prophets (عليهم السلام) is mentioned in the Quran and *hadith* (prophetic narration), likewise their being alive in the paradise is also proven in many narrations. Those *mufti* victims of sectarianism and the ulema of various sects who have dished out the belief of life in the earthly grave put forward in the defence of their belief, that prophets (ﷺ) are alive in their graves and do worship. This belief of the sectarian *ulema* openly contradicts Quran as explained below.

It is said about Yahya (عليه السلام) in the Quran:

وَسَلَامٌ عَلَيْهِ يَوْمَ وُلِدَ وَ يَوْمَ يَمُوتُ وَ يَوْمَ يُبْعَثُ حَيًّا

[مریم: 15]

*And peace be upon him the day he was born and the day he dies and the day he is raised alive.*

It is said about Isa (عليه السلام) in the Quran:

وَالسَّلَامُ عَلَيَّ يَوْمَ وُلِدْتُ وَ يَوْمَ أَمُوتُ وَ يَوْمَ أُبْعَثُ حَيًّا ۝

[مریم: 33]

*"And peace is on me the day I was born and the day I will die and the day I am raised alive."*

Thus it is proven by the Quran that the prophets (عليهم السلام) will be resurrected after giving them life again.

Believing in the life of the prophets in their graves despite this doubt-free statement of the Quran is most certainly rejection of the Quran itself. But knowing the verdict of Quran well, they still believe in the life of the prophets in the graves because they have propagated in the entire *ummah* that their saints, like the prophets (عليهم السلام), are all also alive in their grave and listen to the prayers of the people made over their graves and then bless them with their needs. To prove that these saints are alive in their graves, first they tried to prove that our Prophet (ﷺ) is alive in his grave based on invented narrations and then a step further, attempted to prove that all the prophets are alive in their graves.

The critique of the *ahadith* presented to prove the belief of the life of the prophets (عليهم السلام) in their graves is presented:

(1)

حَدَّثَنَا الْحُسَيْنُ بْنُ عَلِيٍّ عَنْ عَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ بْنِ يَزِيدَ بْنِ جَابِرٍ، عَنْ أَبِي الْأَشْعَثِ الصَّنَعَانِيِّ، عَنْ أَوْسِ بْنِ أَوْسٍ، قَالَ: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ: «إِنَّ مِنْ أَفْضَلِ أَيَّامِكُمْ يَوْمَ الْجُمُعَةِ، فِيهِ خُلِقَ آدَمُ، وَفِيهِ النَّفْعَةُ، وَفِيهِ الضَّعْفَةُ، فَأَكْثَرُوا عَلَيَّ مِنَ الصَّلَاةِ فِيهِ، فَإِنَّ صَلَاتِكُمْ مَعْرُوضَةٌ عَلَيَّ، فَقَالَ رَجُلٌ: يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ كَيْفَ تُعْرَضُ صَلَاتُنَا عَلَيْكَ وَقَدْ أَرَمْتَ؟ - يَعْنِي بَلِيَّتْ - فَقَالَ: «إِنَّ اللَّهَ قَدْ حَرَّمَ عَلَيَّ الْأَرْضَ أَنْ تَأْكُلَ أَجْسَادَ الْأَنْبِيَاءِ»

( ابو داؤد، نسائي، مسند احمد )

*Aws b. Aws reported the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) as saying, "Among the most excellent of your days is Friday; so invoke many blessings on me on that day, for your blessing will be presented*

to me. A person said: O, Messenger of Allah, how can our blessings be presented to you, when your body has decayed? He said: Allah has prohibited the earth from consuming the bodies of Prophets” (implying that dust will not consume the bodies of the prophets like the other human beings and they remain preserved).

One of the narrator of this hadith, *Husain bin Ali Al-Ju’fi* got deceived in the names when he narrates this hadith from Abdul Rahman bin Yazeed bin Jabir who is categorized as a trustworthy narrator. But actually it is not him but narrator *Abdul Rahman bin Yazeed bin Tamim* who is categorized as ***munkar al-hadith*** (a denouncer of hadith). Imam Bokhari says:

“AbdulRahman bin Yazeed bin Tameem Al-Salami Al-Shami has narrated from Makhool and Al-Waleed bin Muslim heard from him that his narrations contain denounced *ahadith*. It is said that he is the same person from whom the people of Kufa Abu Usama and Husain bin Ali Al-Ju’fi and his name has been mentioned as Abdul Rahman bin Yazeed bin Tamim instead he said that he was Abdul Rahman bin Yazeed bin Jabir who was a trustworthy narrator”.

(*Al-Tareekh Al-Kabir* page 365, Qum 1, Volume 3 by Imam Bokhari)

“Al-Waleed said that there was a book by Abdul Rahman bin Yazeed bin Jabir which he had written by listening it. And there was another book, the narrations of which he had not heard himself. People of Kufa Abu Usma and Husain bin Ali Ju’fi have mentioned the name of Abdul Rahman bin Yazeed bin Jabir whereas the person from whom he has heard the narrations was Abdul Rahman bin Yazeed bin Tamim not Abdul Rahman bin Yazeed bin Jabir. And the former that is bin Tamim is a denouncer of hadith”.

(*Al-Tareekh Al-Saghir* page 175, Published by *Al-Athariya* by Imam Bokhari)

Abu Usma (Hammad bin Usama) deliberately neglected it knowingly that the narrator of this hadith is Abdul Rahman bin Yazeed bin Tamim not the trustworthy Abdul Rahman bin Yazeed bin Jabir.

(*Tahdheeb Al-Tahdheeb*, Volume 6, pages 295-296, *Tarjuma* (biography) of Abdul Rahman bin Yazeed bin Tamim)

Al-Dhahabi says that it is the saying of Bokhari that when **I label someone with munkar al-hadith (denouncer of narration) then I do not consider narrating from him as jaaiz (religiously permissible).**

(Page 217 *Silsila Al-ahadeeth Al-Dha’ifa wa Al-Moduw* by Nasiruddin Albani)

(2)

حَدَّثَنَا عَمْرُو بْنُ سَوَادٍ الْبَصْرِيُّ، حَدَّثَنَا عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ وَهَبٍ، عَنْ عَمْرِو بْنِ الْحَارِثِ، عَنْ سَعِيدِ بْنِ أَبِي هِلَالٍ، عَنْ زَيْدِ بْنِ أَيْمَنَ، عَنْ عَبَادَةَ بْنِ نُسَيْبٍ، عَنْ أَبِي الدَّرْدَاءِ، قَالَ: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ: "أَكْثَرُ وَالصَّلَاةِ عَلَى يَوْمِ الْجُمُعَةِ فَإِنَّهُ مَشْهُودٌ تَشْهَدُهُ الْمَلَائِكَةُ، وَإِنْ أَحَدًا لَنْ يُصَلِّيَ عَلَيَّ إِلَّا عَرِضَتْ عَلَيَّ صَلَاتُهُ (ابن حَتَّى يَفْرُغَ مِنْهَا)". قَالَ: قُلْتُ: وَبَعْدَ الْمَوْتِ، قَالَ: "وَبَعْدَ الْمَوْتِ، إِنَّ اللَّهَ حَرَّمَ عَلَى الْأَرْضِ أَنْ تَأْكُلَ أَجْسَادَ الْأَنْبِيَاءِ، فَتَبْقَى اللَّهُ حَيًّا يُرْزَقُ

(ماجہ کتاب الجنائز)

*It was narrated from Abu Darda' that the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) said: "Send a great deal of blessing upon me on Fridays, for it is witnessed by the angels. No one sends blessing upon me but his blessing will be presented to me, as soon as he finishes them." A man said: "Even after death?" He said: "Even after death, for Allah has forbidden the earth to consume the bodies of the Prophets, so the Prophet of Allah is alive and receives provision."*

**This hadith has been graded as Dha'if (weak).**

*"According to Imam Bokhari, narration of Zaid bin Ayman from Ubadah bin Nasi' is **mursal**" (attributed directly despite disconnection in the chain of narrators).*

*(Al-Tareekh Al-Kabir page 387, Volume 2. Tahdheeb Al-Tahdheeb, Volume 3, page 398).*

Moreover, the opportunity for Zaid bin Ayman to hear from Ubadah bin Nasi' is not proven. (Quoting from Ubadah bin Nasi' is **mursal (disconnected)** as mentioned in *Maraseel Abi Dhur'a*) and opportunity of Ubadah bin Nasi' to listen from Abu Darda is also not proven. "And I assume that his narrations on the authority of the great narrators is disconnected" *Kashif Al-Dhahabi*).

Albani has also judged him to be 'weak'.

(Dha'if Ibn Majah by Albani).

(3)

حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ عَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ بْنِ الْمُفَضَّلِ الْحَرَّانِيُّ، نا الْحَسَنُ بْنُ قُتَيْبَةَ الْمَدَائِنِيُّ، نا أَحْمَدُ بْنُ سَلَمَةَ، عَنْ عَبْدِ الْعَزِيزِ، عَنْ أَنَسِ، قَالَ: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ: (مسند البزار) الْأَنْبِيَاءُ أَحْيَاءُ يُصَلُّونَ فِي قُبُورِهِمْ، وَهَذَا الْحَدِيثُ لَا نَعْلَمُ أَحَدًا تَابِعَ الْحَسَنَ بْنَ قُتَيْبَةَ عَلَى رِوَايَتِهِ

*"The Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) said that the prophets are alive in their graves and they perform salat (the prayers)." After presenting these words, Imam Bazzar made the note that "And this hadith, we do not know of anyone who followed al-Hasan ibn Qutaybah on his narration".*

The status of a narrator of this hadith, *Muhammed bin Abdul Rahman bin Al-Mufadhal is unknown*. Also note that there is severe criticism on the second narrator, Hasan bin Qutaybah:

Abul Fat'h Al-Azdi:

“He is superficial in hadith”, *Abu Ja'far Al-Uqaili: “Excessive in delusions”* Hatim AL-Razi:: *“Without strength in narrations, Weak in narrations”*. Al-Dara Al-Qutni:: *“Forgery or abandoning narrations and once said: “Weak in narrations. Al-Dhababi:: “perished”*

(Meezan Al-ai'tidal, Lisan Al-Meezan, etc)

(4)

حَدَّثَنَا رَسُولُ اللَّهِ بْنُ مُوسَى، نَا الْحَسَنُ بْنُ قُتَيْبَةَ، نَا الْمُسْتَلِيمُ بْنُ سَعِيدٍ، عَنِ الْحَجَّاجِ يَعْنِي: الصَّوَّافِ، عَنْ ثَابِتٍ، عَنْ أَنَسٍ: أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ قَالَ:  
الْأَنْبِيَاءُ أَحْيَاءٌ فِي قُبُورِهِمْ يُصَلُّونَ.

“Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) said that the prophets are alive in their graves and perform salat.” After narrating these words, Imam Al-Bazzar notes that:

وَهَذَا الْحَدِيثُ لَا نَعْلَمُ رَوَاهُ عَنْ ثَابِتٍ، عَنْ أَنَسٍ إِلَّا الْحَجَّاجُ، وَلَا عَنِ الْحَجَّاجِ إِلَّا الْمُسْتَلِيمُ بْنُ سَعِيدٍ، وَلَا نَعْلَمُ رَوَى الْحَجَّاجُ عَنْ ثَابِتٍ إِلَّا هَذَا  
الْحَدِيثَ

“And for this hadith, we do not know that it has been narrated on the authority of Anas () except Al-Hajjaj, and no one other than Mustalim bin Saeed narrates from Al-Hajjaj.

(Musnad Al-Bazzar)”

“It has been mentioned about the first narrator of this (*hadith*), Hasan bin Qutayba: Abul Fat'h Al-Azdi::.....

Following is found about the second narrator, Mustalim bin Saeed:

“Ibn Hajar:: It is said in *Al-Taqreeb: Sadouq* (Truthful) worshipper, (but) likely to have become delusional. Shubah said:

“I didn't think that he was amongst the experts of hadith.”

(Taqreeb, Al-Tahzeeb)

(5)

حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو الْجُهَيْمِ الْأَزْرَقِيُّ بْنُ عَلِيٍّ، حَدَّثَنَا يَحْيَى بْنُ أَبِي بُكَيْرٍ، حَدَّثَنَا الْمُسْتَلِيمُ بْنُ سَعِيدٍ، عَنِ الْحَجَّاجِ، عَنْ ثَابِتِ الْبُنَاتِيِّ، عَنْ أَنَسِ بْنِ مَالِكٍ، قَالَ  
رَسُولُ اللَّهِ: “الْأَنْبِيَاءُ أَحْيَاءٌ فِي قُبُورِهِمْ يُصَلُّونَ

(مسند ابو يعلى)

“Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) said that the prophets are alive in their graves and perform salat.”

Following is found about the second narrator, *Mustalim bin Saeed*:

Previously we have mentioned about him.

The second narrator of this hadith Hajjaj bin Al-Aswad narrates *munkar* (denounced) hadith from Thabit Al-Banani. Al-Dhahabi presents the following narration as a proof of this assertion:

“Hajjaj Bin Aswad, on the authority of Thabit Al-Banani, denied what was narrated from him as far as I know, except for Mustalim Bin Saeed, He came with *munkar* news about the prophets, on the authority of Anas (رضى الله عنه): “The Prophets are alive in their graves praying.”

(Meezan Al-I'tidal)

(6)

قَالَ أَبُو يَعْلَى: ثنا أَبُو الْجُهْمِ الْأَزْرُقِيُّ بْنُ عَلِيٍّ، ثنا يَحْيَى بْنُ أَبِي بُكَيْرٍ، وَقَالَ الْبَرَّازُ: ثنا رَزَقُ اللَّهِ بْنُ مُوسَى، ثنا الْحَسَنُ بْنُ قُتَيْبَةَ، قَالَ: ثنا الْمُسْتَلِمُ بْنُ سَعِيدٍ، عَنِ الْحَجَّاجِ عَنْ ثَابِتٍ، عَنْ أَنَسِ بْنِ مَالِكٍ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ، قَالَ: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ: "الْأَنْبِيَاءُ أَحْيَاءٌ فِي قُبُورِهِمْ يُصَلُّونَ" قَالَ الْبَرَّازُ: لَا نَعْلَمُ رَوَاهُ عَنْ ثَابِتٍ إِلَّا الْحَجَّاجُ وَلَا عَنْ حَجَّاجٍ إِلَّا الْمُسْتَلِمُ، وَلَا رَوَى الْحَجَّاجُ عَنْ ثَابِتٍ إِلَّا هَذَا: وَأَخْرَجَهُ عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ عَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ الْحَرَاذِيِّ، عَنِ الْحَسَنِ بْنِ قُتَيْبَةَ، عَنْ حَمَّادٍ، عَنْ عَبْدِ الْعَزِيزِ، عَنْ أَنَسِ بْنِ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ، وَقَالَ: لَا نَعْلَمُ أَحَدًا تَابَعَ الْحَسَنَ بْنَ قُتَيْبَةَ فِي رِوَايَتِهِ إِلَّا هَذَا عَنْ حَمَّادٍ

(المطالب العالیه بزوائد المسانید الثانیہ لابن الحجر)

This narration also contains the narrator *Hasan bin Qutayba* and the chain of narrators is also the same. Its detailed explanation has been given in the narration about Al-Bazzar.

(7)

حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو الْجُهْمِ الْأَزْرُقِيُّ بْنُ عَلِيٍّ، حَدَّثَنَا يَحْيَى بْنُ أَبِي بُكَيْرٍ، حَدَّثَنَا الْمُسْتَلِمُ بْنُ سَعِيدٍ، عَنِ الْحَجَّاجِ عَنْ ثَابِتِ الْمُبَنْيِّ، عَنْ أَنَسِ بْنِ مَالِكٍ قَالَ: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ: "الْأَنْبِيَاءُ أَحْيَاءٌ فِي قُبُورِهِمْ يُصَلُّونَ"

(زوائد ابى يعلى الموصلى الهيثمى)

This narration has been mentioned earlier with reference to Al-Bazzar.

Its chain of narrators is also the same. Its details can be seen there.

(8)

أَخْبَرَنَا أَبُو الْقَاسِمِ الْحَسَنُ بْنُ عَلِيٍّ بْنِ وَثَاقٍ التَّصْيِيبِيُّ، قَرَأَهُ عَلَيَّهِ سَنَةَ أَرْبَعٍ وَأَرْبَعِينَ وَثَلَاثَ مِائَةٍ. ثنا عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ تَاجِيَةَ الْبَغْدَادِيُّ، أَبَا أَحْمَدَ بْنَ عَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ الْحَدَّادِي، ثنا الْحَسَنُ بْنُ قُتَيْبَةَ. ثنا الْمُسْتَلِيمُ بْنُ سَعِيدٍ، عَنِ الْحَجَّاجِ بْنِ الْأَسْوَدِ، عَنِ ثَابِتٍ، عَنِ أَنَسِ، قَالَ: قَالَ النَّبِيُّ: "الْأَنْبِيَاءُ أَحْيَاءٌ فِي قُبُورِهِمْ يُصَلُّونَ"

(فوائد تمام الرازي)

One of the narrators of this narrations is *Abul Qasim Al-Hasan bin Ali bin Wathaq is majhool al haal* (unknown status). So is Ahmed bin Abdul Al-Raman Al Hadani. Criticism on Hasan bin Qutayba has already been mentioned. Al-Mustaneer bin Saeed is also declared: **Status unknown**. Remaining chain that is 'Hajjaj said on the authority of Anas (رضى الله عنه)' is declared *munkar* (denounced). Read narration number 4.

(9)

أَخْبَرَنَا أَبُو سَعْدٍ أَحْمَدُ بْنُ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ الْحَلِيلِ الصُّوفِيُّ، رَحِمَهُ اللَّهُ، قَالَ: أَنْبَأَ أَبُو أَحْمَدَ عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ عَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ الْحَمَافِيُّ قَالَ: ثنا قُسْطَنْطِينُ بْنُ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ الرَّومِيُّ، قَالَ: ثنا الْحَسَنُ بْنُ عَرَفَةَ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنِي الْحَسَنُ بْنُ قُتَيْبَةَ الْمَدَائِنِيُّ، ثنا الْمُسْتَلِيمُ بْنُ سَعِيدٍ الثَّقَفِيُّ، عَنِ الْحَجَّاجِ بْنِ الْأَسْوَدِ، عَنِ ثَابِتِ الْمُبَلَّغِيِّ، عَنِ أَنَسِ، رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ، قَالَ: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ: "الْأَنْبِيَاءُ أَحْيَاءٌ فِي قُبُورِهِمْ يُصَلُّونَ"، هَذَا حَدِيثٌ يُعَدُّ فِي إِفْرَادِ الْحَسَنِ بْنِ قُتَيْبَةَ الْمَدَائِنِيِّ، وَقَدْ رَوَى عَنْ يَحْيَى بْنِ أَبِي بُكَيْرٍ، عَنِ الْمُسْتَلِيمِ بْنِ سَعِيدٍ، عَنِ الْحَجَّاجِ عَنِ ثَابِتٍ، عَنِ أَنَسِ بْنِ مَالِكٍ

(حياة انبياء في قبورهم للبيهقي)

The narrator Qustanteen bin Abdullah Al-Rumi is declared: **Unknown status**.

Criticism on *Hasan bin Qutayba* has already been mentioned earlier.

Chain of narrators "on the authority of *Al-Hajjaj bin Al-Aswad* on the authority of Thabit Al-Bunani is denounced. Details have been mentioned earlier.

(10)

وَهُوَ فِيمَا أَخْبَرَنَا الثَّقَفِيُّ، مِنْ أَهْلِ الْعِلْمِ، قَالَ: أَنْبَأَ أَبُو عَمْرٍو بْنُ حَمْدَانَ، قَالَ: أَنْبَأَ أَبُو يَعْلَى الْمَوْصِلِيُّ، ثنا أَبُو الْجَهْمِ الْأَزْرُقِيُّ بْنُ عَلِيٍّ، ثنا يَحْيَى بْنُ أَبِي بُكَيْرٍ، ثنا الْمُسْتَلِيمُ بْنُ سَعِيدٍ، عَنِ الْحَجَّاجِ عَنِ ثَابِتٍ، عَنِ أَنَسِ بْنِ مَالِكٍ، رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ، قَالَ: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ: "الْأَنْبِيَاءُ أَحْيَاءٌ فِي قُبُورِهِمْ يُصَلُّونَ"، وَقَدْ رَوَى مِنْ وَجْهِ آخَرَ، عَنِ أَنَسِ بْنِ مَالِكٍ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ مَوْفُوقًا

(حياة انبياء في قبورهم للبيهقي)

It is difficult to determine who is narrator Al-Thiqa.

Chain of narrators “on the authority of Al-Hajjaj bin Al-Aswad on the authority of Thabit Al-Bunani is denounced. See narration number 4.

(11)

وَرَوَى كَمَا أَخْبَرَنَا أَبُو عَبْدِ اللَّهِ الْحَافِظُ، ثنا أَبُو حَامِدٍ أَمْدُ بْنُ عَلِيٍّ الْحُسَيْنِيُّ، إِمْلَاءً، ثنا أَبُو عَبْدِ اللَّهِ مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ الْعَبَّاسِ الْجَمْعِيُّ، بِمَنْصُ، ثنا أَبُو الرَّبِيعِ الزَّهْرَانِيُّ، ثنا إِسْمَاعِيلُ بْنُ طَلْحَةَ بْنِ يَزِيدَ، عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ عَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ بْنِ أَبِي لَيْلَى، عَنْ ثَابِتٍ، عَنْ أَنَسٍ، رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ، عَنِ النَّبِيِّ قَالَ: "إِنَّ الْأَنْبِيَاءَ لَا يُتْرَكُونَ فِي قُبُورِهِمْ بَعْدَ أَرْبَعِينَ لَيْلَةً، وَلَكِنَّهُمْ يُضَلُّونَ بَيْنَ يَدَيِ اللَّهِ حَتَّى يُنْفَخَ فِي الصُّورِ".

(حياة انبياء في قبورهم للبيهقي)

Following has been said about the narrator *Abu Hamid Ahmed bin Ali Al-Hasanvi*:

Al-Dhahabi:

He mentioned him in Al-Mughni fi *Al-Dhu'fa* (weak narrators) Ibn Al-Jawzi: Accuses him of **fabrication (of narrations)**. *Abu Abdullah Muhmmmed bin Al-Abbas Al-Hamsi: Unknown status*. *Ismael bin Talha bin Yazeed: Unknown status*. *Muhammed bin Abdul Rahman bin Abi Layla: .....* Abu Bakr Al-Bayhaqi: He said in Al-Sunan Al-Kubra: **He is not strong in hadith**, and said on one occasion: **he cannot be taken as the binding proof and in Marafat Al-Sunan and Al-Athaar: there is no binding proof because he is singled out due to his poor memorization and a large number of errors in the narrations, and once said about him: He is person with lot of delusions.**

Jowzjani:

Superficial in hadith with bad memorization, *Ibn Uday*: He, despite his poor memorization, writes his hadith. *Hatim al-Razi*:: His place is in truthful narrators, **but he had poor memorization, he was occupied with the judiciary and his memorization was poor, he was not accused of anything of lying, but he was rejected due to lot of error**, His hadith may be written but not taken as the final proof. And *Ibn Abi Layla* and *Hajjaj bin Artah* and is closer to both of them. *Al-Nasai*:: **One of the men of understanding but is not strong in hadith**. *Al-Bukhari*: **A truthful person, and I do not narrate anything from him because he does not know the authenticity of his hadith from his defective and very weak ahadith**. *Ali bin Madini*: Has poor memorization and superficial in hadith.



(12)

حَدَّثَنَا عَلِيُّ بْنُ هَمُوْدٍ، ثنا عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ إِبْرَاهِيمَ بْنِ الصَّبَّاحِ، ثنا عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ يَحْيَى بْنِ أَبِي بُكَيْرٍ، ثنا يَحْيَى بْنُ أَبِي بُكَيْرٍ، ثنا الْمُسْتَلِمُ بْنُ سَعِيدٍ، عَنْ شِجَاجٍ عَنْ ثَابِتِ الْبُنَانِيِّ، عَنْ أَنَسِ بْنِ مَالِكٍ، قَالَ: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ: "الْأَنْبِيَاءُ فِي قُبُورِهِمْ يُصَلُّونَ"

(اخبار اصبهان لابي نعيم)

*Ali bin Mahmood bin Malik:: Status unknown*

*Abdullah bin Ibrahim bin Sabah:: Status unknown*

(13)

قَالَ: وَأَنَا تَمَّامٌ، أَنَا أَبُو الْقَاسِمِ الْحَسَنُ بْنُ عَلِيِّ بْنِ وَتَاقِ النَّصِيبِيِّ، قِرَاءَةٌ عَلَيْهِ سَنَةٌ أَرْبَعٌ وَأَرْبَعِينَ وَفَلَاثِمَاتٍ، نَا عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ نَاجِيَةَ الْبَغْدَادِيِّ، نَا أَحْمَدُ بْنُ عَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ الْحَرَّانِيُّ، نَا الْحَسَنُ بْنُ فَتْنِيَّةَ، نَا مُسْتَلِمُ بْنُ سَعِيدٍ، عَنْ حَجَّاجِ بْنِ الْأَسْوَدِ، عَنْ ثَابِتٍ، عَنْ أَنَسِ، قَالَ: قَالَ النَّبِيُّ: "الْأَنْبِيَاءُ أَحْيَاءٌ فِي قُبُورِهِمْ يُصَلُّونَ."

(تاريخ دمشق لابن عساکر)

*Abul Qasim Al-Hasan bin Ali bin Wataq:: Status unknown*

Chain of narrators "on the authority of Al-Hajjaj bin Al-Aswad on the authority of Thabit Al-Bunani is denounced. Details have been mentioned earlier.

**It, thus, becomes evident that all of these narrations contradicting the Quran are 'weak'.**

Another narration is presented that on the occasion of the 'Ascent to the Heavens', the Prophet (ﷺ) saw Musa (عليه السلام) praying in his grave. This was a miraculous exposure as the whole of the night was about miracles. In the same night, Prophet (ﷺ) also saw Musa (عليه السلام) and other prophets (عليهم السلام) in the heavens as well as led the prayers of the prophets in Bait Al-Maqdis. In view of this, should we take Musa (عليه السلام) alive in three places, why in the grave alone. Also see the following narration:

عَنْ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ عُمَرَ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمَا: أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ قَالَ: "أُرَانِي اللَّيْلَةَ عِنْدَ الْكَعْبَةِ، فَرَأَيْتُ رَجُلًا أَدَمَ، كَلْحَسَنِ مَا أَنْتَ رَأَى مِنْ أَدَمِ الرِّجَالِ، لَهُ لَيْثَةٌ كَلْحَسَنِ مَا أَنْتَ رَأَى مِنَ اللَّيْمِ قَدْرَ جَلْهَى، فِيهِ تَقَطَّرَ مَاءٌ، مُتَّكِمًا عَلَى رَجُلَيْنِ، أَوْ عَلَى عَوَاتِقِ رَجُلَيْنِ، يَطُوفُ بِالْيَدَيْتِ. فَسَأَلْتُ: مَنْ هَذَا؟ فَقِيلَ: الْمَسِيحُ ابْنُ مَرْيَمَ. وَإِذَا أَنَا بِرَجُلٍ جَعْدٍ قَطِيطٍ، أَعْوَرَ الْعَيْنِ الْيَهُودِيَّ، كَلْمَتَا عَيْبَةَ طَافِيَّةَ، فَسَأَلْتُ: مَنْ هَذَا؟ فَقِيلَ: الْمَسِيحُ الدَّجَالُ" (بخارى، كتاب اللباس، باب الجعدي)

*Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) said, "Today I saw myself in a dream near the Ka`ba. I saw a whitish brown man, the handsomest of all brown men you might ever see. He had the most beautiful*

*limma (hair hanging down to the earlobes) you might ever see. He had combed it and it was dripping water; and he was performing the Tawaf around the Ka`ba leaning on two men or on the shoulders of two men. I asked, "Who is this?" It was said, "Messiah, the son of Maryam." Suddenly I saw a curly-haired man, blind in the right eye which looked like a protruding out grape. I asked, "Who is this?" It was said, "He is Messiah Ad-Dajjal (the False Messiah)."*

If someone believes that Isa (عليه السلام) and Dajjal are in the Kaaba all the time, then what could be said about this belief!

**It is, therefore, aimed to prove that all the prophets (عليهم السلام) are alive in the paradise near Allah Taa'la. They will be raised up alive again on the Day of the Qiyamat (resurrection) by Allah Taa'la.**

May Allah Taa'la facilitate our understanding and our action upon it.